

PATMOS LIBRARY  
RESOLUTION TO DENY APPEAL OF RECONSIDERATION REQUEST  
REGARDING HEARTSTOPPER 1, 3 AND 3

At a meeting of the Library Board of the Patmos Library held in the Library on the 3<sup>rd</sup> day of October, 2022, at 6:30 p.m., prevailing Eastern Time.

PRESENT: Members Larry Walton, Marcia Frobish, Kathy VanZandbergen, Angela Rodenhouse & Deb Fridsma  
ABSENT: Members John Strick

The following resolution was offered by Member Marcia Frobish and supported by Member Angela Rodenhouse

WHEREAS, the Patmos Library was established under the provisions of the City, Village and Township Libraries Act, 1877 PA 164 (“PA 164”);

WHEREAS, pursuant to PA 164, the Board is authorized to enact policies governing the use of the Library and has adopted a Material Selection Policy;

WHEREAS, pursuant to terms of the Policy, a requester filed a Request for Reconsideration for “Heartstopper 1, 2, and 3”;

WHEREAS, the basis for reconsideration was stated as follows: “putting doubt into the childrens [sic] minds about their sexuality and giving vivid pictures which cannot be easily erased.” Further, the reconsideration request states: “this material of questionable sexual behavior cannot be on the grab shelf without parental supervision. It is inappropriate for tween, young adult free for all shelves.” The request attached as Exhibit 1 provides the full explanation for the basis for reconsideration;

WHEREAS, pursuant to that policy, the requester filed an appeal with the Patmos Library Board (“Library Board”). The appeal request is attached as Exhibit 2 to this Resolution;

WHEREAS, the Library Board met on October 3, 2022, to consider the appeal.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED AS FOLLOWS: the Library Board of the Patmos Library has determined it is in the best interest of the Library to deny the appeal to remove “~~The Breakaways~~” (“Books”) from the Library Collection for the following reasons: Heartstopper

1, 2, & 3

1. Under the United States Constitution, the law recognizes a First Amendment “right to receive information” from a public library. *Kreimer v. Bureau of Police*, 958 F.2d 1242, 1255 (3d Cir.1992). A decision to remove a book from the Library impacts that “right to receive information” because patrons will no longer have access to the Books at the Library.
2. This request for reconsideration asks for the Library Board to censor information that would otherwise be available to other patrons because of the content and subject matter of the Books.

3. The First Amendment right to receive information cannot be denied to other patrons because people may dislike the ideas, content and subject matter contained in the Books.
4. The Books do not violate Michigan or federal law, so patrons who desire to read the Books are entitled to First Amendment protection against censorship.
5. In addition to following federal and state laws, the Library has enacted a Material Selection Policy to assist the Library with its mission of education, and with protecting the First Amendment Rights of its patrons.
6. Based on the United States Constitution, federal and Michigan law, and the Library Board's Material Selection and retention policy, the Library Board selection and retention of "Heartstopper 1, 2 and 3" ("Books") is consistent with Library Policy for the following reasons:
  - A. The Library is not in violation of federal or state law by maintaining a copies of the Books in the Library. In fact, the Library is upholding a fundamental right guaranteed by the Constitution.
  - B. Based on the Section V.A of the Policy, the Library has determined that the selection of material should not be made based on anticipated approval or disapproval by patrons or Library users, but solely on the merits of a work, without regard to race, nationality, political or religious view of the writer. Thus, the Library may include books with themes or a passage that will not be agreed upon by everyone.
  - C. The Library has determined there are no compelling governmental interests in this instance that would allow it to remove the Books or censor the Books on the basis of their content or the fact that some people disagree with the messages.
  - D. Based on Section V.B of the Policy, parents or legal guardians be responsible for the selection of materials and the Library cannot restrict materials because one person may find them objectionable or that children can access them if their parents chose not to accompany them to the Library. This denies the rights of parents to select the Books for their child.
  - E. The Books meet the Principles for Selection and other standards of the Library's Material Selection Policy:
    - 1) There is contemporary significance and interest in checking out this material. The Books have been adapted into a Netflix series.
    - 2) The title within the goal of material selection is to provide a well-balanced and broad collection of materials and meets the selection criteria to show different points of view.

- 3) The reviews demonstrate that the material is positive as Kirkus calls it "An adorable diary of love's gut punches."
- 4) The author won the Goodreads Choice Awards, Best Graphic Novel Comic 2020 for Heartstopper V 3.
- 5) The text and drawings are easy to understand.

7. All resolutions that are in conflict with this Resolution are repealed.

YEAS: 4 - DEB FREIDSMAN, MARCIA FROBISH, ANGELA RODENHOUSE, LARRY WALTON

NAYS: 1 - KATHY VANZANDBERGEN

Resolution declared Approved

STATE OF MICHIGAN            )  
   )  
 COUNTY OF OTTAWA            )

I, the undersigned, the duly qualified and acting Secretary of the Patmos Library, Ottawa County, Michigan, DO HEREBY CERTIFY that the foregoing is a true and complete copy of certain proceedings taken by the Library Board at a regular meeting held on the 3<sup>rd</sup> day of October 2022 at 6:30 p.m.

Deb Freidman  
 Secretary

83583:00001:6689351-2

Brought in May 12, 2022

Book 2 of 4

Page 1 of 2

**Appendix 1:  
Request for Reconsideration of Materials Form**

If you wish to recommend the removal of materials from the collection, please answer the following questions:

1. Author of the item Alice Osema

2. Title of the item Heartstopper 1, 2 & 3

3. How was the item brought to your attention? concerned citizens & parents

4. Do you know what literary critics/reviewers think of this item? Yes  No

5. Have you read the entire book/listened to entire CD/ watched entire movie Yes  No  first 39 pages & parts throughout

6. Are you objecting to the entire item? yes

7. What, in your opinion, is the theme of the item? to teach & encourage thru word & graphic pictures to "COME OUT" from their normal sexuality

8. What is your objection to the item? (Be specific; cite pages/tracks) turn over page

9. In what section of the library is the item found?

Adult  Young Adult  Juvenile

10. What do you feel might be the result of reading this book/listening to this CD/watching this movie? putting doubt into childrens mind about their sexuality & giving vivid pictures which cannot be easily erased

11. If the item were removed from the library, what similar item would you recommend to replace it? Love, Sex & God For Young Men Bill Ameiss

[Redacted Signature]

Signature

[Redacted Street Address]

Street Address

[Redacted City]

City

State

[Redacted Telephone]

Telephone

5-12-2022

Date

Read first 39 pages <sup>read</sup> looked at  
graphics throughout book

### Description:

Boy meets boy. Boys becomes friends.

Boys fall in love. An LGBTQ+

graphic novel about life, love &

every thing that happens in between.

This material of questionable  
sexual behavior cannot be on  
a grab shelf without parents super-  
vision. It is inappropriate for  
tween, young adult free for all  
shelves.

August 8, 2022

To each member of the Jamestown Township Library Board – Patmos Library

Re: Requests for 4 Books to be Reconsidered for removal or coding

Because of immoral material with visual sexual content, profanity, and a written intention of having “‘Amanda’ not only to come out of the closet but to keep exploring all sides of her sexually once she was out.”

(this is a direct quote from the author of Kiss 8 which is one of the books being asked by the board to address.)

4 Books were brought before the acting librarian director and denied any adjustment of removal or rating or coding.

Kiss 8

Spinning

Heartstopper

The Breakaways

Age Category: directed and put on open shelving for 4<sup>th</sup>-8<sup>th</sup> grade

Reason for Request: This material is not even fit for adult reading\viewing let alone children who are not of age and should be protected by parents, community and country.

Added Points to be considered: Public broadcasting on TV bleeps out profanity and nudity. Movie industry rates their movies according to content for children under age, or children needing parent supervision, or R ratings. Gaming Media is rated for E, everyone or Adult Material

advising and providing input for kids and parents to be aware of content. It is appalling that a librarian can put any material into a library without accountability so easily but making it nearly impossible to remove a book after in.

Another Factor: if this is only 2<sup>nd</sup> avenue to proceed, it should not only be a President that gets to decide..the Board members should be reading the questionable material, without bias, or threat of anything being involved with your FAITH., since our children. All of our children are at risk!

Resubmitted by

August 8, 2022